SUMMARY MINUTES OF THE HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION

CITY OF SAINT PAUL, MINNESOTA

Lower Level – Room 41, City Hall/Court House, 15 West Kellogg Boulevard **June 10, 2010**

Present: Robert Ferguson, John Manning, Matt Mazanec, Mark Thomas, Diane Trout-Oertel **Absent:** Jennifer Haskamp, Pat Igo, Rich Laffin, Lee Meyer, David Riehle, Steve Trimble,

Staff Present: Christine Boulware, Amy Spong

BUSINESS MEETING

CALL TO ORDER: 5:10 PM by John Manning (Chair)

- I. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA –
- II. CONFLICTS OF INTEREST None

III. APPROVAL OF THE MEETING MINUTES

- **A.** April 8, 2010 Business Meeting approved, Trout-Oertel Thomas
- **B.** April 22, 2010 Public Hearing Laid over to the July 8 meeting
- C. May 13, 2010 Business Meeting Laid over to the July 8 meeting
- **D.** May 27, 2010 Public Hearing Laid over to the July 8 meeting

IV. CHAIR'S ANNOUNCEMENTS

- **A.** Suggested that commissioners visit Ramsey County Historical Society to check out their new archival collection room/research center.
- **B.** Discuss HPC education focus or have a subcommittee discussion at the next business meeting (July 8)

V. STAFF ANNOUNCEMENTS

A. May Design Review Statistics (see attached)

The commissioners present formed a design review committee to conduct the following review: VI. PERMIT REVIEW/PUBLIC HEARING/AFTER-THE-FACT REVIEW

A. 223 Bates Avenue, Dayton's Bluff Historic District, by Global Systems Inc., for a building permit to add a dormer/egress and new stairs and landings to the west elevation of the building. **File #10-016** (Boulware, 266-6715). **Continued from March 25, 2010.**

Staff read the report recommending conditional approval of the application as resubmitted. Manning asked for a description of how this design differs from the one presented previously and the role of Historic Saint Paul in the project. Peggy Dunnette, owner, was present to discuss the proposal. She stated she was comfortable with staff recommendations. There was discussion about what would happen if there were changes required with the railing height. Commissioner Ferguson asked if the applicant had considered using the skylight opening for egress. Commissioner Mazanec stated the building is a treasure and commended the owner on working on a better design and maintaining the building. **Trout-Oertel motioned to approve the application with staff recommendations. Thomas seconded the motion. The motion passed**

VII. OLD BUSINESS/DISCUSSION

5-0.

A. Union Depot Multi-Modal Transit project, by Ramsey County Regional Rail Authority (RCRRA), ongoing updates regarding the design/build process.

Michael Bjornberg, HGA, Greg Huber, Mortenson Construction, Greg Brown, URS, presented

updates on the project and carriageway proposal to the HPC. Staff gave a summary and background of the project and meetings. The HPC has review authority, but is also a consulting party to the MOA. Staff and SHPO have differing opinions regarding the treatment of the carriageway. The HPC will review the demolition bid package at the July public hearing. Due to the impact of LRT, the front drive will no longer have vehicular access. The carriage way under the front lawn is currently nine feet wide and will need to be thirteen feet – eight inches. Photos were shown and design options were discussed. There was discussion about the old storefront bays and a debate about the historic fabric of the site vs. the building. Greg Huber explained that all scenarios will require some demo and the arch would have to be removed. Staff asked about impact to the plaza and the greenspace. Staff explained that SHPO prefers the doublecarriageway. Staff asked if greater importance should be given to the historic stone or the historic landscape. Trout-Oertel stated the material will be removed and rebuilt, thus it's already lost. Manning asked about differentiating the old from the new. Staff replied it would be a different arch with new stone, but compatible in style. Trout-Oertel stated the two should be differentiated some how, such as being installed in a different plane, but put the arch closer to the street to help the landscape. Bjornberg stated they want to try to avoid confusion between vehicle and pedestrian use with the arched entries. Ferguson stated his worry about the loss of the landscape and noted that trees would help mask the loss. Staff stated the site will be used differently, but the Head House needs to remain the main entry. Thomas asked about the intact store fronts being retained and restored. Thomas, Ferguson and Mazanec agreed that more landscape should be retained. Trout-Oertel stated her preference for one arch instead of two. Manning made a comment about differentiating bicycle and pedestrian access. Trimble asked about ADA access.

Greg Huber discussed the plans for the train deck and demolition vs. permanent removal along Kellogg and Sibley. Greg Brown explained the determination of which areas could carry the train load and replacement of portions of the deck and the Sibley viaduct. The areas with active freight rail are separately owned. The retaining wall at Second Street is failing. One bay of the deck will be removed along Kellogg and in-filled with a two-story structure and area for bus access. The old baggage tunnel will be removed and in-filled.

The original columns were Cap Turner. Individual columns will be repaired and replaced inkind. A field of columns will be replaced with a different style. The consulting parties weighed in on the column choices and preferred the "center choice" at a June 9 meeting. There was talk about how the rebuilt area at Shepard and Sibley will be experienced. Greg Brown stated the east sidewalk will be wider and Bjornberg stated the skyway and 1970s post office building will be removed. Staff replied this will improve the connection with the river. There was talk about how to address the columns in the center of Kellogg under the concourse. The area will be improved with better lighting and a median to help with pedestrian crossing. The left turn from Wacouta to Kellogg will be eliminated. HPC members present expressed a preference for one of the column tops shown and a comfort level with single carriageway.

VIII. COMMITTEE REPORTS

- **A.** Public Safety Building update (Manning, Igo) Martin Schieckel and Amy Spong received and are reviewing three proposals in response to the RFP for documentation.
- **B.** 3M Committee update (Trimble, Mazanec) Commissioner Trimble at 3M Advisory Group meeting tonight. Discussion about the proposed core historic district boundaries and the one building (#19) that is individually eligible for listing on the NRHP. The Port Authority is only required to write one National Register nomination. The HPC will request that the Port Authority write the nomination for the historic district.
- C. Public Art St. Paul Stewardship Committee (Laffin) None

IX. ADJOURN : 6:35 Submitted by: C. Boulware